

Paul and Prayer

Sanae Masuda R. S. C. J.

INTRODUCTION

In none of his epistles Paul teaches a systematic doctrine on prayer. Nevertheless, when we read his epistles, we realize that they are shot through with a spirit of prayer. There are fragments of liturgy, exhortations to pray and his own prayers. This paper is an attempt to grasp something of Paul's understanding of and attitude toward prayer from these elements.

In the discussion, the epistle to the Hebrews was excluded, since modern scholarship, both Catholic and Protestant, seems to doubt the Pauline authorship of Hebrews.¹⁾ As to the epistle to the Ephesians and Pastoral Letters, the opinions are varied, and since no definitive conclusions have been reached,²⁾ and it is not within my capacity to give judgment on this question, they were included in the discussion.

CHAPTER I PAUL AND COMMUNAL PRAYER

Part 1. Liturgy

From the Acts of the Apostles and Pauline epistles, we can get a fairly clear picture of the communal worship of the early Christian

1) Joseph A. Fitzmyer. "New Testament Epistles," *The Jerome Biblical Commentary*, vol. II., ed. by Raymond E. Brown et al. (New Jersey, 1968) p. 225.

2) Joseph A. Grassi. "The Letter to the Ephesians," *The Jerome Biblical Commentary*, vol. II, p. 342.

George A. Denzer. "The Pastoral Letters," *The Jerome Biblical Commentary*, vol. II, p. 351.

community.³⁾ The first Christians gathered in the Temple in accordance with the Jewish custom (Acts 2:46, 5:42). At the same time, they were growing beyond its limits, and were gathering in particular houses (Acts 1:13, 2:46, 5:42, 12:12). The communal worship may have taken place in different places in different churches. The church of Jerusalem was far from the Temple, and the sacrament of eucharist was kept at home, whereas at Antioch, its daughter church, the liturgy of the eucharist and the community as such were more closely related.⁴⁾ The sabbath may have been observed here and there, but one day was specially marked out by them for the services—the first day of the week (Acts 20:7) on which Christ had risen from the dead and appeared to the disciples.

From the Acts we also find that the teaching of the apostles, prayer and the breaking of the bread were the foundation of the worship of the Christian community (Acts 2:42, 46, 20:7). Probably not all the prayers were liturgically fixed. On the other hand, there seem to have been some prayers used from the early days in the liturgy. Cullmann considers that the designation of all prayer as a "saying of Abba" in Galatians 4:6 and Romans 8:15 is the indication of the liturgical usage of the Lord's Prayer.⁵⁾ However, the oldest liturgical prayer seems to be *Maranatha*, "Come, Lord Jesus" or "The Lord is coming," preserved in Aramaic (1 Cor. 16: 22). The fact that this prayer is handed down by Paul untranslated and that it continued in that original form until the time of the composition of the Didache (10:6) shows the extraordinary importance of the role which this oldest liturgical prayer of the early Christian community must have played.

3) Oscar Cullmann. *Early Christian Worship* (London, 1953) pp. 7-33. He also uses the Didache and the Book of the Revelation of St. John as sources for the reconstruction of the liturgy of the early Christian community.

4) David M. Stanley. Lectures on St. Paul, at the University of San Francisco, summer 1968.

5) Cullmann. *Early Christian Worship*, p. 13.

As to "the breaking of the bread," this unusual expression to designate a meal, indicates that it means more than an ordinary meal. In Jewish circles this term was used to designate an action which included the prayer of praise of Yahweh and the breaking of bread at the beginning of the meal. It was related to the meal which followed. Christians borrowed the term to designate a completely self-contained act which is set in a liturgical context.⁶⁾

Conjectures can be made as to the other parts of the liturgy. The Pauline passage, "If anyone does not love the Lord, a curse on him" (1 Cor. 16:22), which precedes the *Maranatha* seems to confirm the practice of a confession of sins which the Didache says must precede the eating of the meal (Didache 14:1). Also the "holy kiss" mentioned in the verse previous to the one just quoted (1 Cor. 16:20) and in other places (Rom. 16:16, 2 Cor. 13:12, 1 Th. 5:26) seems to have been in liturgical usage.

It also seems certain that the formula "Jesus is the Lord" was used as the faith confession among the early Christians when they gathered (Rom. 10:9, 1 Cor. 12:3, 2 Cor. 4:5, Phil. 2:11). The formulae of benediction of stereotyped and solemn character may be explained from their use in the gathering of community. The formulae of benediction which stand at the end of the epistles (1 Cor. 16:23, 2 Cor. 13:13, Gal. 6:18, Phil. 4:23, 1 Th. 5:28) may have originated from the liturgy. There are numerous doxologies in the Pauline epistles (Rom. 1:25, 9:5, 11:35, 2 Cor. 11:31, Gal. 1:5, Eph. 1:3, Phil. 4:20, 2 Tim. 4:18) which owe their origin to the service of worship. That the liturgical *Amen* taken over from Judaism is said by the congregation can be assumed from 1 Cor. 14:16 and 2 Cor. 1:20.

In the early Christian Church, besides the liturgy of the Lord's Supper, the liturgy of baptism was taking a fixed form. The account of the baptism of the Ethiopian Eunuch's baptism in the Acts 8:37 in the Western text suggests the baptismal liturgy. The

6) Edward J. Kilmartin. *The Eucharist in the Primitive Church* (New Jersey, 1965) p. 145.

eunuch's answer, "I believe that Jesus Christ is the Son of God," seems to refer to the earliest baptismal faith confession. It also seems probable that as early as the first century, whenever someone who had come to the faith was brought for baptism, enquiry was made whether any hindrance existed; "What hinders?" (Acts 8:36). And when conviction was reached that the candidate had fulfilled the conditions, the declaration similar to Philip's answer, "Thou mayest (be baptized)," could follow.⁷⁾

In spite of the restrictive elements of the liturgy, the worship of the early Christian community does not seem to have been paralyzed, but instead lively and joyful (Acts 2:46). Neither do Pauline epistles become frozen because of their great number of liturgical formulae. This seems to result from Paul's attitude toward tradition.

Paul insists that he is not the originator of the Christian tradition in the liturgy. In his account of the institution of the eucharist, he says:

I myself received from the Lord (what I also delivered to you), that the Lord Jesus, on the night in which he was betrayed.....(1 Cor. 11:23)

By comparing this narrative (vv. 23-25) with those found in the Synoptics, we learn how carefully, even to the expression, Paul relayed these traditional data. This account also betrays his understanding that the tradition of the Church originated in the historical Jesus and the Risen Lord, and receiving it from the apostolic Church means receiving it from the Lord. Paul considered exactitude in this matter as of paramount importance:

I praise you, brethren, because in all things you are mindful of me and keep the traditions as I gave them to you. (1 Cor. 11:2)

However, as to the elements of the liturgy which are not divinely instituted, Paul seems to have a very open and free attitude. These are enumerated in 1 Cor. 14:26.

When you come together each of you has a hymn, has an instruction,

7) For further detailed discussion on the topic, c. f. Cullmann. *Baptism in the New Testament* (London, 1961) pp. 71-76.

has a revelation, has a tongue, has an interpretation.

From vv. 30 and 32 we know that a revelation is prophesying, a spiritual gift given to "talk to men for edification, and encouragement, and consolation" (1 Cor. 14:3). There seem to have been a great number of people with the gift.

.....if anything is revealed to another sitting by, let the first keep silence. For you can prophesy one by one, so that all may learn and all may be encouraged. (1 Cor 14:30 f)

This shows that Paul allowed place for free proclamation in their communal worship.

As to the gift of tongues, he says:

.....he who speaks in a tongue does not speak to men but to God; for no one understands, as he is speaking mysteries in his heart. (1 Cor. 14:2)

He who speaks in a tongue edifies himself.....unless he can interpret so that the church may receive edification. (1 Cor. 14:4 f)

Paul exhorts them; "Let all things be done unto edification" (1 Cor. 14:26); since they are "God's building" (1 Cor. 3:9). Therefore, "let one interpret. But if there is no interpreter let him keep silence in the church, and speak to himself and to God." (1 Cor. 14: 27 f)

Here we find that even glossalalia was allowed for the individual to speak in the Spirit if it can "be done unto edification." On the other hand, Paul is aware that for both revelation and the gift of tongues caution is needed in order to keep order and peace in the gathering. (1 Cor. 14:33, 39 f)

Another important element of the service of worship was psalms and hymns. There is a non-Christian document which gives an account concerning early Christian communal worship. In the year 112, Caius Plinius Caecilius reported to Emperor Trajan on his reports at stamping out Christianity in Bithynia:

They (the Christians) insisted, however, that their whole crime or error came to this: they had the custom of meeting on a certain fixed day, before daybreak, to sing a hymn, alternating among themselves, to Christ as God; and to bind themselves solemnly by an oath, not

with any criminal intent, but to avoid all fraud, theft, adultery, unfaithfulness to their promises, or denial of the deposit if summoned to do so. After dispatching this business, it was their habit to disband, reassembling once more to take food, which is, however, of an ordinary and innocent kind.....⁸⁾

There are different opinions as to the nature of the two liturgies mentioned above. Some hold that the first was a baptismal liturgy held in the early morning hours, and the second was the Lord's Supper celebrated in the late afternoon or evening,⁹⁾ while others consider the first also as the liturgy of the breaking of the bread.¹⁰⁾

Whatever the nature of the two liturgies mentioned is, as it seems unlikely that Pliny would have forbidden a simple fraternal meal in the evening, both of them must have been some kind of communal worship in which songs had an important place. That this must have been the case can be attested from Paul's teaching on hymns:

Let the word of Christ dwell in you abundantly; in all wisdom teach and admonish one another by psalms, hymns and spiritual songs, singing in your hearts to God by his grace. Whatever you do in word or in work, do all in the name of the Lord Jesus, giving thanks to God the Father through him. (Col. 3:16f)

By means of psalms, hymns and songs, the Christian community teach one another and at the same time offer prayer to God. These hymns originated within the community, and their authorship remained anonymous; they remained the property of the community and were, in the course of time, continually reworded or readapted to the community's varying liturgical needs.¹¹⁾ They are the voice

8) Quoted by Stanley in *The Apostolic Church in the New Testament* (Maryland, 1965) pp. 98f.

9) Vincent Taylor. *The Formation of the Gospel Tradition*, 2nd ed. (London, 1949) pp. 44 ff.

Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, p. 99.

10) Cullmann. *Early Christian Worship*, p. 22.

Kilmartin, p. 150.

11) Cullmann. *Early Christian Worship*, p. 21.

of the community, therefore, "the word of Christ." Paul refers to liturgical hymnody as "the word of Christ" *λογος του Χριστου* and distinguishes it from *λογος του κυριου* or *λογος του θεου*, and also from *διδαχη*. "The word of the Lord" or "the word of God" is used in referring to kerygma proclaimed by the disciples of the apostolic age to the non-Christian world. "The teaching" is that deeper, theological interpretation of the events announced by the kerygma, made by the authoritative teachers of the Church for the believing Christians. "The word of Christ" is addressed by the community, the Body of Christ, assembled for a liturgical function to God the Father and also to itself for mutual instruction and edification.

In another place, Paul says:

.....be filled with the Spirit, speaking to one another in psalms and hymns and spiritual songs, singing and making melody in your hearts to the Lord, giving thanks always for all things in the name of our Lord Jesus Christ to God the Father. (Eph. 5:18 ff)

This text is almost parallel with the passage in Colossians, except two variations which throw further light on the nature of these early hymns. Colossians spoke of the hymns as sung "to God," but here it is "to the Lord." Paul uses *κυριος* for Yahweh of the Old Testament (1 Cor. 3:20, 10:26, 2 Cor. 14:21, etc.), but the absolute *δ κυριος* becomes Paul's title of predilection for Jesus (Rom 14:8 f). It expresses Paul's understanding that Christ is equal with Yahweh himself, and is the Lord of all creation and has the right to the adoration of all creation. Thus, there is no real difference between the hymns sung to God and those addressed to Christ. This is not only because he, like the Father, is a divine Person. Since the whole movement of the redemption accomplished by Christ originates with the Father (Rom. 5:8, 2 Cor. 5:18), a song to Christ as Redeemer is a hymn of praise of the Father.

The second variation is the mention of the Holy Spirit. It clarifies the meaning of the "spiritual" songs. The liturgical use of

hymns by the Christian community is "spiritual," not merely because they have a religious and theological character, but also because they are inspired by the Holy Spirit, the Spirit of Christ. In Paul's view, by the liturgical recitation of such hymns the Christian community becomes filled with the Spirit, to whom the unity and peace of the Body is due, as he says in Ephesians:

I.....exhort you to walk in a manner worthy of the calling with which you were called,careful to preserve the unity of the Spirit in the bond of peace: one body and one Spirit, even as you were called in one hope of your calling..... (Eph. 4:1-4, para. Col. 3:15)¹²⁾

We have seen Paul's idea of liturgical hymns. We have seen the importance of their functions in the early Christian liturgy, and their main purposes—mutual instruction and building up of the Body. Now I am going to take three fragments of hymns in the Pauline epistles, whose authorship by Paul is questioned, in order to find indications in them of Paul's attitude toward the liturgy.

(a) Phil. 2:5-11.

Opinions are varied as to the hymnological nature of this passage. Cerfaux regards this passage as prose, though rhythmical.¹³⁾ Fr. Stanley, on the other hand, after giving several examples, concludes, "Modern commentators concur in recognizing the hymnological nature of the passage."¹⁴⁾

Moreover, there are different opinions as to the authorship of this hymn. Cerfaux claims this hymn as an authentic work of Paul: "the hymn fits the exhortation which we had just heard, and the ideas and even the wording echo it,"¹⁵⁾ and "also contains the whole of Paul's theology of Christ."¹⁶⁾ However, he admits:

12) Stanley. "Carmenque Christo Quasi Deo Dicere," *The Apostolic Church*, pp. 95-99.

13) Lucien Cerfaux, *Christ in the Theology of St. Paul*, transl. by G. Webb and A. Walker (New York, 1958) pp. 376 f.

14) Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, pp. 346 f.

15) Cerfaux, p. 376.

16) *Ibid.*

We should in no way disagree that behind such sentences there are shades of similar extracts from such works as the Odes of Solomon, the liturgical psalms and the songs of the Servant of Yahweh.¹⁷⁾

Schmitt says:

The Pauline elements which it carries have, as a whole, only relative importance and affect on the whole the proclamations on the humility of Jesus (vv. 7-8). In fact, it well marks a direct trace of the christological prayer, so characteristic of primitive christianity.¹⁸⁾

Fr. Stanley is in line Schmitt's thought, and discusses the authorship of the hymn according to internal evidences.¹⁹⁾ His translation of the hymn is as follows:

Who, while He kept His character as God,
did not consider His divine equality
something to be proudly paraded.

No, He despoiled Himself
by taking on the Servant's character,
becoming similar to mortal men.

And looking outwardly like any other man,
He carried self-abasement, through obedience,
right up to death, yes, death by the cross.

Therefore did God in turn immeasurably exalt Him,
and graciously bestow on Him the Name,
outweighing every other name;

that everyone, at Jesus' Name,
should bow adoring: those in heaven,
on earth, in the infernal regions,

17) *Ibid.*, p. 377.

18) "Les éléments pauliniens qu'il comporte n'ont, somme toute, qu'une importance relative et affectent plutôt les déclarations sur l'humilité de Jésus (vv. 7-8). En fait, il marque bien une vestige directe de la prière christologique, si particulière à la chrétienté primitive." Joseph Schmitt. *Jésus Ressuscité dans la Prédication Apostolique* (Paris, 1949) pp.99.

19) Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, pp. 346-351.

and every tongue take up the cry,
"Jesus is Lord,"
thus glorifying God His Father.²⁰⁾

The conception of this hymn is a simple one, almost naive in some respects, yet profoundly theological. When he might have claimed the divine honors, which were always his by right as pre-existent Son of God, still he freely chose, for the carrying out of his redemptive mission, the lowly way of humiliation and suffering. To reward him, God exalts him by conferring "the Name." This new name is the divine title *κύριος*, which in the Greek Bible was constantly used for the sacred tetragram of Yahweh. For the Hebrews a name expressed the nature of a person to whom it was attached. This gift of God's own Name to Jesus signifies the revelation of his divinity through his glorification. Therefore, all creatures inhabiting the Hebraic three-storied universe join to adore the God-Man and to offer the doxology "Jesus is Lord." This acclamation is equivalently an act of praise of God the Father, the author of Christ's salvific work and revealer of his Son's divinity.

This song is inspired by the fourth Servant Song (Isa. 52:13-53:12). The prophet had depicted the Servant as humiliated, as burdened with the sins of the multitude, suffering even death for their sakes and in their stead; and this heroic conduct, springing from his perfect submission to God, is the very reason for his exaltation. In Philippians, Christ's career is similarly characterized as a kenosis that provides the divine motive for rewarding him with the name Lord. Moreover, the terminology of this hymn betrays its Isaian origin.

The theme of the "Ebed Yahweh" is an emphatically Jewish theme, and in late Judaism it had been commonly related to the fate of Israel itself. With the advent of Christianity, Messianic implications of the Isaian message plays an important role in the

20) *Ibid.*, pp. 114-5.

apostolic preaching, especially that of Peter (Acts 3:12-26, 10:36 ff). And the liturgical prayer offered by the Jerusalem Church bears witness to their conception of Christ as the Isaian Servant (Acts 4:27-30).

Now when we turn our eyes to Paul, there is something singular to be noticed. The servant theme is not employed by him to express the redemptive work of Christ, either in his epistles or in the sermons ascribed to him in Acts, with the exception of the passing allusion in Rom. 4:25 and here in Phil. 2:6-11. Even in Rom. 4:25, in the second verse there is a variation from the Isaian servant theme. Paul there speaks of faith in Jesus "who was delivered up for our sins, and rose again for our justification." The first half of the verse is a reminiscence of the closing phrase of Isa. 53:12: "and for their sins was he handed over." But already in the second clause, a new theological conception makes its appearance: the finality of the exaltation of Christ is primarily "for our justification," and not merely for Jesus' glorification, as in the Isaian prophecy (Isa. 52:13, 53:12).

Leaving aside Phil. 2:6-11, and turning to other references to the servant theme in the Pauline epistles, we find a considerable number of them, but applied in a completely new context. In his letter to the Galatians, he expresses his awareness of the call to be a servant from the moment of the event on the road to Damascus. Gal. 1:15 reminds us of the second Servant Song (Isa. 49:1-6). Rom. 10:14 f quotes, as the motive for his apostolate, Isa. 52:7 which describes the work of the Servant:

How then are they to call upon him in whom they have not believed?
 And how are they to believe in him of whom they have not heard?
 And how are they to hear, if no one preaches? As it is written, "How beautiful are the feet of those who preach the gospel of peace, of those who bring glad tidings of good things!"

In 2 Cor. 6:1 f Paul reveals his consciousness of his mission of bringing salvation as a Christian in the context of Deutro-Isaian

Servant by the citation of the second Servant Song (Isa. 49:8).

However, throughout his missionary career, Paul is conscious that Christ himself is the Servant par excellence. 2 Cor. 5:20 gives us this insight into his understanding:

On behalf of Christ, therefore, we are acting as ambassadors, God as it were, appealing through us. We exhort you, for Christ's sake, be reconciled to God.

His vocation as servant is "on behalf of Christ," "in the name of Christ." God uses the apostle, as he had used Christ, his Servant par excellence, to carry his revelation to men. Paul is able to call himself a servant because he is an "ambassador" of the Servant, to continue his ministry among men.

So far we have seen Pauline development of Palestinian christology. Going back to Phil. 2:6-11, it is peculiar with its Deutro-Isaian soteriology which in no other place is used by itself to explain Christ's redemptive work. Therefore, it is likely:

.....that this hymn is not a Pauline composition, but one which originated in the theological milieu of Palestinian Christianity.in his letter to that Church (at Philippi) he cites an ode already familiar to them, not indeed to teach the redemptive nature of Christ's death and resurrection, but to inculcate a much-needed lesson in Christian humility.²¹⁾

This consideration gives us some idea of Paul's attitude toward the liturgy. After meeting Christ on the road to Damascus, Paul was humble enough to go to the Church which he had persecuted. He must have taken part in its liturgy and learned from its tradition. Though, as to the origin of his gospel, he says in Galatians that he was not taught it but it came to him through a revelation of Jesus Christ,²²⁾ we must remember that when Paul wrote Galatians, he

21) Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, p. 350.

22) Gal 1:11, 15-17, 2:6. "A revelation of Jesus Christ" in Gal. 1:12 is considered by many exegetes today as a revelation Paul received from the Church, the Body of the risen Christ. e. g. Cullmann. "Paradosis and Kyrios," *ScottJT* 3 (1950) 180-197.

was at pains to emphasize his divine and undelegated apostolic commission and the heavenly origin of his gospel to those who attacked it as unauthentic. Probably he learned this hymn during his stay in Asia Minor (Acts 11:26), and used it freely to inculcate a lesson in Christian humility, though originally it was intended to teach about Christ's salvific work. Through a liturgical hymn like this and other traditions of the Church, he must have learned Deutro-Isaian soteriology which was constantly employed in the Palestinian church as exemplified by the discourses of Peter in the Acts (3:12-26, 10:36 ff). This was further developed by his personal experiences. One of these might have been witnessing the death of the first martyr Stephen (Acts 7:58) who was accorded a vision of Christ, not as the suffering and glorified Servant, but as the exalted Son of Man. Nevertheless, it was the vision on the road to Damascus which gave definitive color to all his understanding of Christian kerygma. As Gal. 1:15 shows, Paul understood the event as a call to be a servant in Deutro-Isaian terms. Later when he learned the teachings of the Church, they were transformed in this vision. Paul felt free to develop the theology of the early Church in his own experiences. Here we find him practising his own teaching on the "freedom of the Spirit" (2 Cor. 3:17), which may well have appeared revolutionary in the apostolic church.

(b) Col. 1:15-20.

That it is a hymn seems to be more or less accepted, but as to its authorship, opinion is varied as with Phil. 2:6-11. Cerfaux considers that Paul expounded or built upon an underlying composition,²³⁾ while J. M. Robinson regards it as an incorporation of a pre-Pauline liturgical unit in the epistle.²⁴⁾ A study of its motif may give a clue to the answer.

Who snatched us from the tyranny of darkness,

23) Cerfaux, p. 398.

24) James M. Robinson. "A Formal Analysis of Colossians 1:15-20," JBL 76 (1957) 287.

set us instead beneath His own dear Son's dominion,
in whom we possess our ransom,
the remission of our sins.
Who is the image of the unseen God,
first-born before all creatures;
for in Him all things have been created,
things of heaven, things of earth,
things seen as well as things unseen,
Thrones and Dominions,
Principalities and Powers.

All things have been created by Him, for Him:
yes, He personally exists before all else.
All things in Him keep their coherence:
yes, He personally exists as Head of the Body, His Church.

Who is Beginning,
first-born from among the dead,
so that He might in every order take precedence;
for in Him God was pleased to lodge His whole creation,
and through Him reconcile all things to Him,
things of earth and things of heaven,
achieving peace by means of His blood, shed on the cross.²⁵⁾

Here we find the interest focused on the effect of the part Christ played and the religious situation which results from it. The two main functions of the incarnate Son which the hymn commemorates are his part in the creation of the world and his redemptive work of reconciling "all things." To the order of creation in the first stanza, there is opposed the order of salvation realized by the death and resurrection of Christ. The antithesis of these two orders is intended and stressed by the parallelism in the structure of the two stanzas. The first line of the little section which comes in the middle sums up the first stanza, and the second line introduces the

25) Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, p. 113.

theme of the second.

In the order of creation, Christ is "the first-born." The title is used to describe the pre-eminent position of Christ in the world. Christ enjoys absolute primacy and lordship over all creatures, for "in him," "by him," "for him," all things have been created. Christ is "the image of the unseen God." God himself becomes visible in Christ, his image. Christ as the image of God is, therefore, the revelation and the representation of God. The phrase suggests the comparison with Adam (Gen. 1:26), created to God's image and likeness, and first-born, in one sense, of all humanity.

However, it is in the order of the redemption that the primacy of the incarnate Son as second Adam is most evident. As Redeemer he is "Beginning"; his atoning death begins man's peace with God, just as his resurrection begins man's own future resurrection. As the "first-born from among the dead", he was, like Adam at the first creation, a principle of life for his offspring. Christ's mediation is total: "God was pleased to lodge His whole creation, and through Him reconcile all things to Him....." Nevertheless, a new living bond comes into being between Christ and that part of the universe which accepts his Lordship: Christ and the Church take on the unity of head and body.

Here we find the Pauline conception of Christ as antitype of the first man through whom sin and death came into the world. This conception of Christ as the last Adam, the new Adam, the second Adam, was hit upon in a period of controversy (1 Cor. 15:22, 45), and then was made the focal point in his soteriology (Rom. 5:12 ff). In his mission among the free-loving Greek communities, the second-Adam theme with its universalist interest must have provided a more suitable approach than the notion of the Servant. Moreover, in these pagan communities Christianity must have appeared in all its novelty and freshness as a "new creation."

As in the case of the transmutation of the Servant theme by Paul, here we find of Palestinian soteriology developed by Paul.

Where Palestinian Christianity tended to construct a soteriology based on Christ's fulfilment of the prophesy of Deutero-Isaiah, Paul preached the work of the redemption as a new creation and Christ as the second Adam. However, both themes of a new creation and the second Adam derive their inspiration from the Old Testament.

It seems that Pauline soteriology developed in a distinctive line because of his unique experience of the Risen Lord. The fact that it was the Risen Christ whom Paul first knew gave him an insight into the meaning of the Master's death and enabled him to grasp the more positive aspects of that death's efficacy and the significance of his resurrection than a view suggested by the Servant Christology. Christ's death was dying to sin (Rom. 6:10), and to death itself (1 Cor. 15:26, Rom. 6:9). He had risen from the dead to create a completely new unity of grace and life. Here we find Pauline theology firmly established on the teaching of the apostolic Church, yet giving further insight into it through his personal experience of Christ.

Another motif we find in this hymn is the close relation of the body theme and the head theme. The most Pauline figure, "the body of Christ," expressing the corporate identity of Christians with Christ, is absent from his early letters (1 Th., 2 Th., Gal. and Phil.). It first appears in 1 Cor., where Paul insists on the union of all Christians which is brought about by their share in the eucharistic bread and cup (1 Cor. 10:16 f). The ontological reality that is the basis of the union is the possession of the Spirit of Christ (1 Cor. 12:13).

However, neither in 1 Cor. nor in Rom. does Paul speak explicitly of the Church as the Body of Christ. These two themes—that of the Church and of the Body—are independent developments in the Pauline letters, which merge only in the Captivity Letters. In the latter, when the cosmic significance of Christ has already dawned upon him, he links for the first time the themes of "body," "head,"

and "Church" (Col. 1:18, 24). It seems to have taken some time before Paul realized the union of Christians in Christ in terms of "the Church." In his letters we find growth in his awareness of what "the Church" really meant for man. In the early letters (1 Th. and 2 Th.) Paul uses *ἐκκλησία* in two senses: either to designate a local church, or in the sense of "the church of God," a title of predilection for Judean communities. When we move to the Great Letters, we find it again used in the two senses, referring to the local churches of Galatia, Judea, Macedonia, and Cenchreae. However, the title "the church of God," is now also applied to the church of Corinth. In this extension there is a broadening of Paul's understanding of the idea of *ἐκκλησία*. It begins to transcend the local barriers. And in 1 Cor. we find the seed of Paul's teaching on the universality of the Church (1 Cor. 12:28). When we come to the Captivity Letters the notion of *ἐκκλησία* plays a very important role. In Paul's cosmic view Christ is now the head of all creation and of the Church which is his body.²⁶⁾

In the Captivity Letters, for example in this hymn and Eph 1: 22 f, we learn that Christ is "the head of the body, the Church." The head theme is not just an extension of the body theme, for the head theme appears early in Paul's letters independently of the body theme, not as a figure of unity but of subordination (1 Cor. 11:3 ff). It is only in the Captivity Letters we find the body theme and the head theme joined. Christ is the head of the body, the Church.

What are the sources of these themes of the body, the Church and the head? First he must have gained the conception of the body of Christ from the human body of Christ, and also from the understanding of the eucharist as food (1 Cor. 10:17). Paul's later use of the figure of the head, for example in Eph. 4:16, not simply as the most important part of the body, but as the image of close union which

26) Karl Ludwig Schmidt. "*ἐκκλησία*", TDNT, ed. by G. Kittel (Michigan, 1965) vol. II, pp. 506-513.

exists between the head and the body, perhaps has its source in contemporary medical teaching.²⁷⁾ The word ἐκκλησία is the usual Septuagint rendering of the Hebrew *qahal*, designating either "assembly" or as *qahal Yahweh* Israel itself, the people of God. It is found abundantly in Pauline letters, but it occurs very rarely in the Gospels and in the Acts in the sense of the "church" before the story of Paul begins. It apparently took some time before the early Christians realized their union in Christ in terms of ἐκκλησία, beyond the fact that they are called together by God.

In the consideration of these themes, we have seen that the concept "Christ is the head of the body, the Church" is Paul's typical and original concept which can be found only in his later epistles. Therefore, it seems likely that Paul composed this hymn, perhaps according to a set style. While Phil. 2:5-11 was an example of the repeated pieces of a liturgy, this is one of free compositions in the thanksgiving part of it.

(c) 1 Tim. 3:16.

The hymnological nature of this text seems to be more or less agreed upon, but there is disagreement of opinions as to its authorship. Cerfaux calls it a hymn, but finds there concepts essentially Pauline in the antithesis which contrasts earth to heaven, and in the phrase "he who was manifested in the flesh and who has been justified in the spirit" which reminds him of Rom. 1:3.²⁸⁾ Boudou says, "Paul seems to have taken up for himself and for early believers a fragment of the song in which triumph in Christ is celebrated."²⁹⁾ Schmitt finds in its structure "traces, peculiar to early Christian prosody."³⁰⁾ He also considers the terminology un-

27) Joseph A. Fitzmyer. *Pauline Theology* (New Jersey, 1967) p. 73.

28) Cerfaux, p. 372 f.

29) "Paul semble avoir pris lui aussi aux premiers fidèles un fragment du chant où ils célébraient le triomphe au Christ." Adrien Boudou. *Saint Paul* (Paris, 1950) p. 130.

30) "traits, propres à la première prosodie chrétienne." Schmitt, p. 100.

usual from what Paul uses in his letters, and concludes, "These singularities indicate that the piece betrays a vocabulary in usage among the apostolic liturgy."³¹⁾ The consideration of its theme may lead to some idea of its authorship.

who was revealed through His humanity,
 was justified by the spirit,
 was beheld by angels,
 was proclaimed amongst nations,
 was believed in throughout the world,
 was taken up in glory.³²⁾

Here we find three pairs of verses antithetically arranged to elaborate enthronement theme. This triple structure appears to have been modeled upon the three steps involved in the coronation of an ancient Oriental king, which was in use in Egypt and Mesopotamia. That ceremonial consisted of (1) the *elevation* of the monarch to the divine dignity, (2) his *presentation* to the gods of the national pantheon, (3) his *enthronement*, or accession to supreme power in the state.³³⁾

In this hymn, in the first antithesis Jesus is revealed as Son of God through the mediation of his sacred humanity, justified or glorified at his resurrection. In the second antithesis Christ is presented to the angels at his Ascension, and to the world, which probably refers to Pentecost (Acts 2:5). The last two verses describe Christ's "enthronement" or "accession to divine power" in terms of the universal acceptance of Christ's lordship and his succession to the glory of the Father.

This enthronement theme was one of the three principal patterns in the New Testament followed by the most ancient Christian symbolism expressive of the dogma of Christ's divinity: Jesus' en-

31) "Ces singularités indiquent que le morceau trahit un vocabulaire en usage dans la liturgie apostolique." *Ibid.*

32) Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, pp. 109 f.

33) Stanley. *The Apostolic Church*, p. 110.

thronement at the right hand of God; the suffering and glorified Servant of Yahweh; and the theme of the Son of Man and second-Adam motif.

Each set of symbols, which can be traced back ultimately to the Old Testament was used by Jesus during his earthly teaching. As to the enthronement theme, in preaching the coming of the kingdom of God, the apostolic Church understood that in the person of Christ it had become a contemporary reality (Lk. 17:21), and he had prophesied to the Sanhedrin on the eve of his death, his imminent elevation to God's right hand (Mk. 14:62). This idea as found in the apostolic preaching was based upon Ps. 110:1 (Acts 2:33-35, 3:20-21). In his early life Paul uses in his preaching this theme, borrowing the concept of Ps. 2:7 directly (Acts 13:33). However, it later appears under a slightly different form as the notion that Jesus has been "constituted Son of God in power" (Rom. 1:4). In this hymn it appears in the form it was used in the apostolic preaching.

This hymn is introduced with a short sentence, "great is the mystery of godliness." Paul equates "God's mystery" to the Lord of glory crucified (1 Cor. 2:7 f), whom he also calls his gospel (1 Cor. 1:17, 23, 2 Cor. 4:5). However, its full import seems to have dawned on him later in his life. In the Captivity Letters above all the mystery reveals Christ to be the meaning and goal of all creation, for the Father plans to bring all created things under the leadership of Christ (Eph. 1:9). Through Christ salvation comes to all men by their incorporation in his body, which is the Church, and he is its head (Col. 1:26 f, 2:2, Eph. 1:9, 3:4-10). In presenting the gospel as "mystery," Paul implies that it is never fully made known to men by the ordinary means of communication. It is apprehended only by faith. Perhaps because of his apostolic experience Paul came to speak of the gospel as "mystery," using a word already familiar in contemporary Greek mystery religion.

When we come back to the hymn, and see it in the context of

mystery, this hymn in a letter written later than the Captivity Letters does not carry the full import of "mystery" as found in his later letters. This fact indicates that it is of an earlier origin.

However, when we look into its vocabulary, an interesting fact emerges. It seems to be a combination of Pauline and non-Pauline terms. On the one hand, it has terms unusual for Paul, such as *πιστευειν* in the passive, *ἐφαγερωθη*, *ἐδικαιωθη* and *ἀνελημφθη* applied to the incarnation, resurrection, and ascension respectively. On the other hand, the antithesis between "flesh" and "spirit" is Pauline, though in this case "flesh" is not used in a pejorative sense which is more typically Pauline. This antithesis has its source not in the Greek concept of dichotomy between soul and body, but in the Semitic understanding of two inclinations in man. "Justification" as a metaphor is almost exclusively a Pauline view of salvation, but applied to the resurrection. The basic meaning of both are the same, when understood as the manifestation of the "uprightness of God," that quality by which Yahweh as the judge of Israel manifests his salvific bounty toward his people in a just decision.

After these considerations, this hymn appears as an originally non-Pauline composition, but with which he may have made non-essential changes in quoting in his letter.

Conclusion

The study of the liturgy of the early community has shown various credal formulae employed to proclaim the common faith of the community. It also appears that both in baptismal and eucharistic liturgies, the hymn was a most common expression of worship. While liturgy must be a sincere expression of real religion by means of external rites, still by the very fact that it is communal worship, a social activity, it is governed by forms and patterns which limit individual expressions of piety.

What was Paul's attitude toward the liturgy? What was his liturgical prayer like? We saw in his teaching on communal worship that there are two sides: on the one hand, he sees the need that

"all things be done properly and in order" (1 Cor. 14:40) and exhorts to keep to the traditions of the Church (2 Th. 2:15), but, on the other hand, he allows place for the "manifestation of the Spirit" (1 Cor. 14:39) that each one has received, since "there are varieties of gifts" (1 Cor. 12:4) which "are the work of one and the same Spirit" (1 Cor. 12:11). We should "not extinguish the Spirit" (1 Th. 5:19), since "the manifestation of the Spirit is given to everyone for profit" (1 Cor. 12:7). Therefore, for himself,

I thank my God, I speak with tongues more than you all: yet in the church I had rather speak five words with my understanding, that I might teach others also, than ten thousand words in a tongue. (1 Cor. 14:18 f)

In studying three liturgical hymns in detail, we have seen this understanding of his put into practice. Phil. 2:5-11, with other teachings of the Church, seem to have instructed him on Deutero-Isaian christology. Yet, with the "freedom of the Spirit" (2 Cor. 3:17) he transmutes the theme. He does not throw it away, but uses it for the instruction of Christians with a different import from the original one. Col. 1:15-20 is more likely his own composition, and can be understood as his own "manifestation of the Spirit" in liturgy. In 1 Tim. 3:16, we find Paul showing his freedom in an already existing form.

There is one thing to be added here in connection with liturgy. In the same place where Paul discusses different gifts of the Spirit, he says, "Let women keep silence in churches, for it is not permitted them to speak....." (1 Cor. 14:34). Does he not allow women to manifest their gifts in the liturgy? Somehow he connects women's subordinate position under the Law with the fall of the first parents (1 Tim. 2:12 ff). Theoretically and theologically, he knows the equality of man and woman under the new dispensation:

.....all you who have been baptized into Christ, have put on Christ. There is neither Jew nor Greek: there is neither slave nor freeman: there is neither male or female. For you are all one in Christ Jesus.

(Gal. 3:27 f)

Yet in daily life, he seems to think in the context of Greek culture, which gave woman a secondary position.

Part 2. Praying Together

Besides liturgies which are more official in character, the early Christians gathered together in order to pray together. The Acts gives us an account of these gatherings. We find in Acts 1:14 that after the Ascension the disciples gathered together and "with one mind continued steadfastly in prayer." Acts 4:24-30 tells us the early Christians raised their voice in petition when they heard Peter and John were threatened. There are other occasions when the community prays together in time of persecution (Acts 12:5, 12). We also know that they prayed together on special occasions, like the election and ordination to office in the Church (Acts 1:24, 6:6, 13:3, 14:23).

Paul, who had been so eager to keep the traditions of his fathers as a Pharisee (Gal. 1:14), must have been wholehearted in sharing all the experiences of the early Christian community (2 Cor. 11:23). We have some records of this kind of St. Paul. Acts 16:25 says that in prison "at midnight Paul and Silas were praying, singing the praises of God, and the prisoners were listening to them." At Miletus, after bidding farewell to the community, Paul "knelt down and prayed with them all" (Acts 20:36).

From these accounts we can assume that Paul had experiences of communal prayer, a kind of sharing private prayer, which stands between strictly liturgical and private prayers. These accounts do not give the contents of the prayers, yet, we can assume that they were more or less the extension of liturgical prayer and at the same time, the externalization of his private prayer. This leads us to the consideration of the next topic, Paul's personal prayer.

CHAPTER II PAUL AND PERSONAL PRAYER

Part 1. Before Conversion

Though born in Tarsus, Paul was brought up in Jerusalem and there educated at the feet of Gamaliel in the traditions of the fathers (Acts 22:3, 23:6, 26:4 f, Phil. 3:5 f, Gal. 1:14, 2 Cor. 11:22). "As a Hebrew of Hebrews" (Phil. 3:4), and "son of Pharisees" (Acts 23:6), Paul was "instructed according to the strict acceptance of the Law of (his) fathers", (Acts 22:3), "advanced in Judaism above many of (his own) nation, showing much more zeal for the traditions of (his) fathers" (Gal. 1:14). And he could say proudly, "as regards the justice of the Law, leading a blameless life" (Phil. 3:6).

From these it seems evident that he prayed as any other Jew of his time. What was the prayer life of the Jews of his time like? Their individual and interior prayer life cannot be known, but the Jewish custom of prayer gives some idea of it. There were two kinds of prayer:³⁴⁾ one was T^ephilla, a creed surrounded by benedictions, and its recitation was considered the minimum of religious practice, and the other was Sh^ema', a hymn consisting of a string of benedictions to which was added private petitions. Another difference of the two was that only free men were obliged to recite the Sh^ema', whereas the T^ephilla was to be said by all, including women, children, and even slaves. At the time of the New Testament, it was the custom of the Jews to recite the Sh^ema' framed by benedictions and followed by the T^ephilla, in the morning and in the evening: in the afternoon at 3 o'clock the latter was prayed alone. These three hours of prayer, together with the benedictions said before and after meals, were the skeleton framework for an education in prayer and for the practice of prayer for everyone from their youth upwards.

34) Joachim Jeremias. *The Prayers of Jesus* (Ill., 1967) pp. 67-72.

Paul must have prayed besides these customary hours. In his defense of himself before the governor Felix, he says:

.....for the hope in the promise made by God to our fathers I am standing trial: to which promise our twelve tribes hope to attain as they worship night and day..... (Acts 26:6)

From this we can imagine that Paul prayed besides regular hours, though it may not have been literally "night and day." He addressed his prayer to "the God of Abraham, the God of Isaac and the God of Jacob" as the first benediction of the T^ephilla says, basing his hope on God's promise. That he must have been trained in prayer before his conversion seems very probable when we read the descriptions of him right after his experience on the Damascus road. The Lord tells Ananias to go to Saul who "is praying" (Acts 9:11). After his baptism he retires to Arabia (Gal. 1:17). We have no account of this retreat or of its purpose. Was it for the purpose of assimilation, in prayer, of the experience he had had?

Part 2. After Conversion

Paul, who had been so zealous for the traditions of his fathers, must have shown the same single-mindedness and zeal for the customs of the early Church. Besides liturgy, which was gradually taking a fixed form, were there any customary hours for prayer that the early Christians kept? We find in the Acts of the Apostles that they kept the Jewish custom of three hours. It refers to the afternoon prayer at 3:00 p.m. (Acts 3:1, 10:3-30). Didache 8:3 says, referring to the Lord's Prayer, "Three times a day you shall pray thus." Probably the early Church regarded the Lord's Prayer as a substitute for the three daily Jewish prayers. From Didache 9-10, we also learn that the Church also had its own grace before and after meals.

The early Christians were not content with the liturgical custom only. Peter prays at twelve noon outside the regular time (Acts 10:9), and the Jerusalem church prays at night for the imprisoned

(Acts 12:5, 12). We also know that Paul prayed outside the regular hours of prayer. Paul and Silas praise God in prison at midnight (Acts 16:25). Vigils, the extension of evening prayer far into the night, even right through the night are often held (2 Cor. 6:5). In his earliest extant letter, Paul says "night and day we pray" (1 Th. 3:10).

What his understanding of prayer was and what his personal prayer was like can be seen from his letters in which he gives his teaching on prayer and which are shot through with prayer.

(a) Pauline Doctrine on Prayer

Paul often exhorts the early Christians to pray "without ceasing" (1 Th. 5:17) and "at all times" (Eph. 6:18): to "be assiduous in prayer" (Col.4:2) and "persevering in prayer" (Rom.12:12), "for this is the will of God in Christ Jesus regarding you all" (1 Th. 5: 18).

Paul distinguishes two aspects of prayer. One of them is thanksgiving:

Rejoice always. Pray without ceasing. In all things give thanks.....
(1 Th. 5:16-18)

Rejoice in the Lord always: again I say, rejoice..... The Lord is near. Have no anxiety, but in every prayer and supplication with thanksgiving let your petitions be made known to God. (Phil. 4:4-6)

Be not slothful in zeal: be fervent in spirit, serving the Lord, rejoicing in hope. (Rom. 12:11)

.....in all wisdom teach and admonish one another.....singing in your hearts to God by his grace. Whatever you do in word or in work, do all in the name of the Lord Jesus, giving thanks to God the Father through him. (Col. 3:16 f)

Be assiduous in prayer, being wakeful therein with thanksgiving.
(Col. 4:2)

.....be filled with the Spirit.....singing and making melody in your

hearts to the Lord, giving thanks always for all things in the name of our Lord Jesus Christ to God the Father. (Eph. 5:18-20)

In these texts we find that gratitude and joy are the keynote. When we recall that the only personal prayer of Jesus of some length recorded in the Gospels from the time before the passion is a thanksgiving in spite of failure (Mt. 11:25, para. Lk. 10:21), we understand that thanksgiving is one of the foremost characteristics of the new age (Eph. 5:3 ff). It is through the coming of Jesus that God's promise is fulfilled, his love is made manifest, his forgiveness definitive, and his reign has started here and now.

.....when the fullness of time came, God sent his Son, born of a woman, born under the Law, that he might redeem those who were under the Law, that we might receive the adoption of sons. And because you are sons, God has sent the Spirit of his Son into our hearts, crying, "Abba, Father." (Gal. 4:4 ff, para. Rom. 8:15 ff)

With the coming of Christ, the Spirit of the Son was given to all. All the prayers of Jesus in all four Gospels have this in common, that except for the cry on the cross, where the invocation is taken from Ps. 22:1, they all invoke God as "Father", which is the translation of "Abba," the Aramaic word Jesus actually used.³⁵⁾ This Aramaic "Abba," which is a colloquialism originally stemming from the language of children, is nowhere attested in Jewish prayers. It definitely represents Jesus' own most characteristic mode of speech and it is the profoundest expression of his authority and of his own consciousness of his mission.

Now this gift of divine sonship by adoption was offered to all, to the impious (Rom. 4:5) who deserves death because he bears the curse of the Law (Gal. 3:13). It is granted to him as a "favor" (Rom. 4:4, 5:17), as a free gift (Rom. 3:24). This grace knows no restriction. Being independent of the Mosaic Law, it can include the Gentiles also.

35) Jeremias. "Abba," *The Prayers of Jesus*, pp. 11-65.

For in Christ Jesus neither circumcision is any avail, nor uncircumcision, but faith which works through charity. (Gal. 5:5f)

Salvation is absolutely and entirely the gift of God. Nothing that man can do contributes in the smallest way to the gift. All that man can do—and that is the only thing that nobody else, whether man or God, can do for him—is to take what God gives (Rom. 1:16, 5:2).

This receiving of the gift which God gives is called by Paul faith:

.....you are all children of God through faith in Christ Jesus. For all of you who have been baptized into Christ have put on Christ. (Gal. 3:26f)

Having believed:

.....in one Spirit we were all baptized into one body, whether Jews or Gentiles, whether slaves or free: and we were all given to drink of one Spirit. (1 Cor. 12:13)

Therefore, we are "the temple of God" in which "the Spirit of God dwells" (1 Cor. 3:16). Since "the fruit of the Spirit is: charity, joy, peace, patience, kindness, goodness, faith, modesty, continency" (Gal. 5:22), those who have put on Christ must "walk in the Spirit" (Gal. 5:16). Paul tells the Christians, "Do not extinguish the Spirit" (1 Th. 5:19), and again, "Do not grieve the Holy Spirit of God" (Eph. 4:30). Immorality, uncleanness, licentiousness, idolatry, witch-crafts, enmities, contentions, jealousies, anger, quarrels, factions, parties, envies, murders, drunkenness, carousings, and such like are the works of the flesh (Gal. 5:19 ff). The Spirit of the Son that can cry out, "Abba, Father", is not within those who walk by the flesh.

In this regard it is noteworthy that there is no direct teaching on prayer in either of the two letters to the Corinthians or the One to the Galatians. In all of them Paul is concerned with the problems of immorality and wrong doctrine. He says to the

Corinthians:

And I, brethren, could not speak to you as to spiritual men but only as carnal, as to little ones in Christ. I fed you with milk, not with solid food, for you were not yet ready for it. Nor are you now ready for it, for you are still carnal. For there are jealousy and strife among you, are you not carnal, and walking as mere men? (1 Cor. 3: 1-4)

Consequently he teaches them, not about "the wisdom of men" but about "the wisdom of God" (1 Cor. 2:1-16). He gives them the great hymn of charity (1 Cor. 13), and tells them to "aim at charity" (1 Cor. 14:1).

He is deeply upset when he thought that the Christians in Corinth had become vain and unstable (2 Cor. 12:11-13:10), and gives them a lesson that our sufficiency is only from God, made manifest in weakness (2 Cor. 12:7-10). In his letter to the Galatians, when Paul sees that they were on the verge of apostasy (Gal. 1:6, 3:1-3), he tells them to "walk in the Spirit" (Gal. 5:16), and not to be caught again under the yoke of slavery of the Law (Gal. 3:4-5:6), for we have been called to liberty of the Spirit, liberty to serve one another in charity (Gal. 5:13).

From these we might say that Paul understands charity as the prerequisite of prayer. If we are not walking in the Spirit, we cannot speak in the Spirit and cry out, "Abba," because the Spirit of Christ is not within us (1 Th. 4:8).

Another aspect of prayer that Paul mentions is supplication or petition:

Have no anxiety, but in every prayer and supplication with thanksgiving let your petitions be made known to God. (Phil. 4:6)

Be patient in tribulation, persevering in prayer. (Rom. 12:12)

Be assiduous in prayer, being wakeful therein with thanksgiving. At the same time pray for us also, that God may give us an opportunity for the word, to announce the mystery of Christ..... (Col. 4:2-4)

With all prayer and supplication pray at all times in the Spirit, and therein be vigilant in all perseverance and supplication for all the saints..... (Eph. 6:18)

Paul tells the Christians to make supplications without anxiety, but with joy and thanksgiving, because:

.....all things are yours, whether Paul, or Apollos, or Cephas: or the world, or life, or death: or things present, or things to come—all are yours, and you are Christ's, and Christ is God's. (1 Cor. 3:22)

He who has not spared even his own Son but has delivered him for us all, how can he fail to grant us also all things with him? (Rom. 8:32)

Christian prayer is not just a wishful thinking out of the human need to appeal to someone stronger and more powerful than himself. It is firmly based on confidence and trust, because Christians believe in God, the Creator of heaven and earth, who enters into personal and individual relationship with his people. Therefore, the prayer of a Christian is founded on the awareness of being a creature totally dependent on the Creator, and a son confidently dependent on his Father. His prayer is based on the trust that God is interested in him as a father, interested in his troubles and problems. He is not only interested, but also powerful enough to give the help that one cannot find in oneself or in any other human being.

He it is who delivered us, and will deliver us, from such great perils: and in him we have hope to be delivered yet again, through the help of your prayers for us. (2 Cor. 1:10 f)

A Christian does not only pray that his tribulation be taken away, as he knows that "for those who love God all things work together unto good" (Rom. 8:28). He can even

.....exult in tribulations also, knowing that tribulation works out endurance, and endurance tried virtue, and tried virtue hope. And hope does not disappoint, because the charity of God is poured forth

in our hearts by the Holy Spirit who has been given to us. (Rom. 5: 3 ff)

Paul asks for prayers for himself: not only that he may be delivered from perils (2 Cor. 1:11, Rom. 15:30 ff, Phm. 1:22), but that God may give an opportunity for the word (Col. 4:3 f), and

.....that when I open my mouth, utterance may be granted to me fearlessly to make known the mystery of the gospel, for which I am an ambassador in chains: so that therein I may dare to speak as I ought. (Eph. 6:19 f)

He thanks for the prayer that the chains he bears for the sake of Christ may turn out for his salvation (Phil. 1:19). This attitude seems to indicate his understanding that since a Christian is not a being by himself and for himself, but a member of "one body and one Spirit" (Eph. 4:4), his supplication is not just for his own need but for others', especially that the news of salvation in Christ may be heard. Actually by praying to one God our Father, he becomes more and more aware of the sonship and brotherhood of all men. This awareness helps him to fulfill the greatest commandment of love.

In all his petitions a Christian does not seek the achievement of his own will. As he has received Jesus Christ as Lord, his desire is to "walk in him, be rooted in him and built up on him" (Col. 2: 6), and thus to "walk worthily of God and please him in all things" (Col. 1:10). Christian prayer is based on hope:

.....the eager longing of creation awaits the revelation of the sons of God. For creation was made subject to vanity—not by its own will but by reason of him who made it subject—in hope, because creation itself also will be delivered from slavery to corruption into the freedom of the glory of the sons of God. For we know that all creation groans and travails in pain until now. And not only it, but we ourselves also who have the first-fruits of the Spirit—we ourselves groan within ourselves, waiting for the adoption as sons, the redemption of our body. For in hope were we saved. But hope that is seen is not hope. (Rom. 8:19-24)

And:

Eye has not seen or ear heard, nor has it entered into the heart of man, what things God has prepared for those who love him. (1 Cor. 2:9)

How can one hope and pray for things beyond one's experience or conception? Paul continues:

.....the Spirit also helps our weakness. For we do not know what we should pray for as we ought, but the Spirit himself pleads for us with unutterable groanings. And he who searches the hearts knows what the Spirit desires, that he pleads for the saints according to God. (Rom. 8:26f)

Paul's hope was not simple optimism, but a dynamism of action as he says:

I press on hoping that I may lay hold of that for which Christ Jesus had laid hold of me..... (Phil 3:12)

In this regard, Paul's speeches in defense in the Acts are indicative. Even if they were Luke's composition, Paul's awareness of being persecuted for this hope presented in all of them must have some historicity. To the Tribune and the Sanhedrin, he says:

.....it is about the hope and the resurrection of the dead that I am on trial. (Acts 23:6)

To king Agrippa and governor Festus:

And now for the hope in the promise made by God to our fathers I am standing trial.....and it is about this hope, O king, that I am accused by the Jews. (Acts 26:6ff)

To the Jews in Rome:

.....it is because of the hope of Israel that I am wearing this chain. (Acts 28:20)

Thus it seems that what Paul understood and taught about prayer in hope was based on what he lived and suffered for.

(b) Personal Prayer

Pauline epistles are shot through by his prayers, implicit or explicit. They are not personal prayers in the strict sense, since, once exteriorized, it excludes that kind of prayer without words. However, they must reflect something of the prayer life Paul had.

In a passage in the letter to the Philippians, we find Paul contrasts what he valued before his conversion and after it.

If anyone else thinks he may have confidence in the flesh, yet more may I: circumcised the eighth day, of the race of Israel, of the tribe of Benjamin, a Hebrew of Hebrews: as regards the Law, a Pharisee: as regards zeal, a persecutor of the Church of God: as regards the justice of the Law, leading a blameless life.

But the things that were gain to me, these, for the sake of Christ, I have counted loss. Nay more, I count everything loss because of the excelling knowledge of Jesus Christ, my Lord. For his sake I have suffered the loss of all things, and I count them as dung that I may gain Christ and be found in him, not having a justice of my own, which is from the Law, but that which is from the faith: so that I may know him and the power of his resurrection and the fellowship of his suffering: become like to him in death, in the hope that somehow I may attain to the resurrection from the dead. (Phil. 3:4-11)

From this we can surmise Paul's prayer before the conversion was more or less like that of the Pharisee in the parable in the Gospel.

O God, I thank thee that I am not like the rest of men, robbers, dishonest, adulterers, or even like this publican. I fast twice a week; I pay tithes of all that I possess. (Lk 18:11 f)

Though Paul was proud of himself "as regards the justice of the Law, leading a blameless life", he knew he was not sufficient for himself. Later he recalls:

Once upon a time I was living without law, but when the commandment came, sin revived, and I died, and the commandment that was unto life was discovered in my case to be unto death. (Rom. 7:9 f)

Though his exterior man conformed to the Law, and the inner man delighted with the law of God, he was aware of himself claiming

self-gratification and not the pleasure of God (Rom. 7:22-25). He was keenly aware of the self-centeredness of the flesh, and his own insufficiency to change the state.

I know that in me, that is, in my flesh, no good dwells, because to wish is within my power, but I do not find the strength to accomplish what is good. (Rom. 7:18)

Perhaps this accounts for the amazing openness when he meets Christ on the road to Damascus. His first question "Who are you, Lord?" (*τις εἶ, κυριε*) (Acts 9:5, 22:8, 26:15) is not necessarily a proof that Paul at this moment realized this unknown Person as equal with Yahweh whom he had believed all his life as Lord. *Κυριος* may mean Lord from Luke's standpoint. However, his whole attitude during this encounter and after this points to the fact somehow he understood this person as divine and equal to Yahweh. He asks, "What shall I do, Lord?" (Acts 22:10), and right away he does what he was told to do (Acts 9:8, 22:11, 26:20). This openness based on the awareness of the need for God made Paul different from other Jews about whom Isaiah prophesied:

Listen carefully, but you shall not understand: Look intently, but you shall know nothing. (Isa. 6:9)

There are other occasions, too, which prove his openness in prayer leading to a dialogue, and his readiness to ask questions, to listen and to obey. One is his prayer in the temple after he had returned to Jerusalem baptized. Christ tells him to "go quickly out of Jerusalem for they will not receive (his) testimony concerning (Christ)" (Acts 22:17 f). And he says:

Lord, they themselves know that I used to imprison and beat in one synagogue after another those who believed in thee..... (Acts 22:19)

This might be Luke's way of presenting the reason of Paul's change of apostolic policy. However, we may be able to say at least that Paul must have prayed over the difficulty of his apostolate among the Jews, and when he was convinced that it was the will of God

for him to go to the Gentiles (Acts 22:21), he starts this revolutionary movement immediately. Another example can be found in his prayer of petition concerning "a thorn for the flesh, a messenger of Satan" (2 Cor. 12:7) which buffeted him:

Concerning this I thrice besought the Lord that it might leave me. And he has said to me, "My grace is sufficient for thee, for strength is made perfect in weakness". (2 Cor. 12:8 f)

The significance of the lesson he learns in a prayer of openness becomes more evident when we see the last prayer within the context. In his reproach of the Corinthians for following "false apostles, deceitful workers, disguising themselves as apostles of Christ" (2 Cor. 11:13) he lists the things he could boast of according to the flesh, and those he will boast of according to Christ:

Since many boast according to the flesh, I too will boast. For you gladly put up with fools, because you are wise yourselves.....Are they Hebrews? So am I. Are they Israelites? So am I. Are they offspring of Abraham? So am I. Are they ministers of Christ? I—to speak as a fool—am more..... (2 Cor. 11:18-23)

These are very much like the things he boasted of in Phil. 3:4-11, but here his realization seems even deeper. He is not proud of even being a minister to Christ. In prayer he learns another scheme of values.

Gladly therefore I will glory in my infirmities, that the strength of Christ may dwell in me. Wherefore, I am satisfied, for Christ's sake, with infirmities, with insults, with hardships, with persecutions, with distresses. For when I am weak, then I am strong. (2 Cor. 12:9 f)

His scheme of values is now that of the crucified Christ, who is:

.....to the Jews indeed a stumbling-block and to the Gentiles foolishness, but to those who are called, both Jews and Greeks, Christ, the power of God and the wisdom of God. For the foolishness of God is wiser than men, and the weakness of God is stronger than men. (1 Cor. 1:23 ff)

Before the conversion, it was Paul himself who was the center of

his world, though aware of the need of God's help, as we have seen. Now it is Christ who is the center of his life. The inspiration of Paul's thought and the spring of his action is in Christ. The cry of anguish in Rom. 7 changes to that of exultation in Christ.

.....the law of the Spirit of the life in Christ Jesus has delivered me from the law of sin and death. For what was impossible to the Law, in that it was weak because of the flesh, God has made good. (Rom. 8:2f)

Paul's life after the conversion is totally Christ-centered. Thus, he can say, "It is now no longer I that live, but Christ lives in me" (Gal. 2:20. para. Phil. 1:20, 2 Cor. 13:3. "Christ in you," Gal. 4:19, 2 Cor. 13:5, Rom. 8:10, Col. 1:27, Eph. 3:17). These words were not uttered by a nonentity but by one of the most forceful personalities in history. It is no longer Paul that prays, but the Spirit of the Son prays in him (Gal. 4:6, Rom. 8:15), because Christ entitled us to address the Father "Abba" as he himself did, and it is through him that we come to the intimate relationship with the Father.

Paul seems to grow gradually in realizing what is actually taking place in prayer. From his experience on the Damascus road, he learnt that Christ is a divine Person equal with Yahweh whom he had worshipped as a Jew. Joining the early Church, he learnt that "God had made both Lord and Christ, this Jesus whom you crucified" (Acts 2:36) from the apostolic preaching, "and straight-way in the synagogues he began to preach that Jesus is the Son of God" (Acts 9:20). There could have been no confusion in the monotheistic faith of either Paul or other apostles. It was clear to them that they were not worshipping two gods in believing in Yahweh and Jesus.

Nevertheless, the experience on the road to Damascus left a vivid and dominant impression on him, which can be testified to by his theology in which all his learning, knowledge, and experiences were understood and transformed through his insight into the mystery of Christ that he had acquired then. It is most natural that such an

experience left a mark on his prayer-life also. It appears that his prayers right after the experience are addressed to the Risen Christ. The One who appears to him in the ecstasy in the temple in Jerusalem soon after his baptism is presented as the Risen Christ (Acts 22:16-21). Another example is the petition, quoted already, concerning "a thorn for the flesh" (2 Cor. 12:2). From the context we learn that this took place "fourteen years" (2 Cor. 12:2) before the account (ca. AD 43-44), several years after the ecstasy in Jerusalem, about ten years after his conversion.³⁶⁾ Here "thrice besought the Lord" (2 Cor. 12:8) clearly refers to Christ, since in the following verse he equates "my grace" as spoken by Christ and "the strength of Christ".

Around the time when he came to write the epistles to the Thessalonians (ca. AD 50-52), we find some of his prayers directly addressed to God (1 Th. 1:2, 5:23, 2 Th. 1:3, 1:11, 2:13). Three of these are prayers of thanksgiving (1 Th. 1:2, 2 Th. 1:3, 2:13) and the other two are prayers of petition. Some prayers are directly addressed to Christ.

May the Lord make you to increase and abound in charity towards one another. (1 Th. 3:12)

It is clear that "the Lord" here means Christ, as the preceding verse has "our Lord Jesus." Another example is, "May the Lord direct your hearts....." (2 Th 3:5). Here also "the Lord" is Christ, since the verse immediately following says "the Lord Jesus Christ". It is also clear from the context that "the Lord" is Christ in another prayer, "May the Lord of peace himself give you peace" (2 Th. 3:16). All these prayers to Christ are supplications.

It is interesting to note that in two places in the epistles to the Thessalonians both the Father and the Son are addressed in Paul's prayer, which does not occur in other letters.

36) Fitzmyer. "A Life of Paul," *The Jerome Biblical Commentary*, vol. II, pp. 218 f.

May God our Father and our Lord Jesus direct our way unto you. (1 Th. 3:11)

.....may our Lord Jesus Christ himself and God our Father..... strengthen your hearts..... (2 Th. 2:16 f)

These two are prayers of supplication.

We notice that in his early stage, Paul's thanksgiving is directed toward God, though he makes petitions directly to Christ or to both. It is probably due to his soteriology which ascribes the salvation of man to the eternal salvific will of the Father revealed and realized in Christ.

.....God has not destined us unto wrath, but to gain salvation through our Lord Jesus Christ..... (1 Th. 5:9)

This Pauline soteriology becomes more dynamic and cosmic in his Great Letters and comes to full expression in the Captivity Letters. Some of the examples are:

.....for us there is only one God, the Father from whom are all things, and we unto him: and one Lord, Jesus Christ, through whom are all things, and we through him. (1 Cor. 8:6)

He who has not spared even his own Son but has delivered him for us all, how can he fail to grant us all things with him? (Rom. 8:32)

And this his good pleasure he purposed in him to be dispensed in the fullness of the times: to re-establish all things in Christ, both those in the heavens and those on the earth. (Eph. 1:9 f)

In these we find his soteriology growing more and more cosmic. God gave all things to men through Christ, and all are to return to the Father through Christ.

Paul's later prayers reveal this growth in soteriology. We find a new phrase "God the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ" start appearing from the second letter to the Corinthians.

Blessed be the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ..... (2 Cor. 1:3, Eph. 1:3)

.....that, one in spirit, you may with one mouth glorify the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ. (Rom. 15:6)

We give thanks to the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ..... (Col. 1:3)

.....making mention of you in my prayers, that the God of our Lord Jesus Christ, the Father of glory, may grant you the spirit of wisdom (Eph. 1:16 f)

I bend my knees to the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ.....that he may grant you..... (Eph 3:14 ff)

In the epistles to the Romans we find a slight variation.

I give thanks to my God through Jesus Christ..... (Rom. 1:8)

.....to the only wise God, through Jesus Christ be honor forever and ever. (Rom. 16:27.³⁷) cf. Eph. 3:21)

There are prayers directly addressed to the Father in his later letters (1 Cor.1:4, 2 Cor.13:7, Rom. 10:1, 15:5, 15:13, 15:33, Phlm. 1:4, cf. Col. 1:12). However, he no longer, at least explicitly, addressed only Christ directly, but half of the time "the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ", or "God through Jesus Christ." His understanding that "all are yours, and you are Christ's, and Christ is God's" (1 Cor 3:23) becomes more and more integrated into his life, and he seems to be living what he teaches others:

Whatever you do in word or work, do all in the name of the Lord Jesus, giving thanks to God the Father through him. (Col.3:17, para. Eph. 5:20)

In his teaching on prayer we have seen that there were two keynotes: supplication and thanksgiving. When we go through his

37) It is generally accepted that Paul wrote chapters 15 and 16 of Romans, though chapter 16 is likely to be a later interpolation of another letter. cf. Gautier Adalbert Hamman, ed. *Early Christian Prayers* (Chicago, 1961), p. 282. Also, Fitzmyer. "The Letter to the Romans", *The Jerome Biblical Commentary*, vol II, p. 330.

prayers of supplication, they seem to be patterned on one or the other of the petitions in the Lord's Prayer. Some of the doxologies make the petition of "Hallowed be thy name" (Rom.9:5, 11:36, 16:27, Eph. 1:3, 3:21). He prays that the Christians in Thessalonica may be filled with faith so that "the name of our Lord Jesus Christ may be glorified" in them (2 Th. 1:12). He also prays that the Philippians be "filled with the fruit of justice, through Jesus Christ, to the glory and praise of God" (Phil. 1:11). The theme of "Thy kingdom come" can be found in "Brethren, my heart's desire and my prayer to God is in their behalf unto their salvation. For..... they have not submitted to the justice of God" (Rom.10:1 ff): that of "Thy will be done" in "we.....have been praying for you unceasingly.....and asking that you may be filled with knowledge of his will, in all spiritual wisdom and understanding" (Col. 1:10).

At the same time, he makes petitions for daily needs:

Night and day we pray more and more that we may see you again, and may supply those things that are lacking to your faith. (1 Th. 3:10)

May the God of hope fill you with all joy and peace in believing, that you may abound in hope and in the power of the Holy Spirit. (Rom. 15:13)

The following seems to echo the petition, "Forgive us our trespasses as we forgive those who trespass against us":

.....being rooted and grounded in love, you may be able to comprehendwhat is the breadth and length and height and depth, and to know Christ's love which surpasses all knowledge, in order that you may be filled unto all the fullness of God. (Eph. 3:17 ff)

"Lead us not into temptation, but deliver us from evil" is echoed in such prayers as: "May no temptation take hold of you but such as man is equal to" (1 Cor.10:13), and "We pray God that you may do no evil at all....." (2 Cor. 13:7).

His thanksgiving prayers go hand in hand with prayers of petition.

It is thanksgiving that God's kingdom has started here and now:

May you be completely strengthened through his glorious power unto perfect patience and long-suffering: joyfully rendering thanks to the Father, who has made us worthy to share the lot of the saints in light. He has rescued us from the power of darkness and transferred us into the kingdom of his beloved Son, in whom we have our redemption, the remission of our sins. (Col. 1:11-14)

Since "the fruit of the light is in all goodness and justice and truth" (Eph 5:9), the signs of the reality of the kingdom of God here and now are faith, hope and love. Therefore, many of his prayers of thanksgiving are for the faith, hope and love the Christians have:

.....we give thanks to God always for you all, continually making a remembrance of you in our prayers: being mindful before our God our Father of your work of faith, and labor, and charity, and your enduring hope in our Lord Jesus Christ. (1 Th. 1:2 f)

We are bound to give thanks to God always for you brethren. It is fitting that we should, because your faith grows exceedingly and your charity each one for the other increases. (2 Th. 1:3)

.....I give thanks to my God through Jesus Christ for all of you, because your faith is proclaimed all over the world. (Rom. 1:8)

We give thanks to the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ, praying always for you, for we have heard of your faith in Christ Jesus and of the love that you bear towards all the saints because of the hope that is laid up for you in heaven. (Col. 1:3 ff)

.....I on my part, hearing of your faith in the Lord Jesus, and of your love for all the saints, do not cease to give thanks for you all
..... (Eph. 1:15 f)

I give thanks to my God, always making remembrance of you in my prayer, as I hear of the charity and of the faith that you have in our Lord Jesus and towards all the saints. (Phlm. 1:4 f)

Conclusion

We have seen that Paul was already trained in prayer as a rabbi. His prayers then might have been self-centered, and somewhat self-righteous.

After his conversion, we know that he prayed outside customary hours. The keynotes of his doctrine of prayer are thanksgiving and petition: thanksgiving because in Christ God's reign has started here and now, and petition in hope because man and the whole universe are still awaiting the end-time. The Spirit of the Son helps man to pray, if he walks in the Spirit.

In his prayers we find that Christ is the center of his life and the Spirit of the Son prays in him, and cries out "Abba." In his early stage, some prayers are addressed to "God our Father and our Lord Jesus Christ." Later, this phrase disappears and he addresses "the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ," or "God through Jesus Christ." This is likely due to his growth in the understanding of the salvation event. We have also seen that, as with his doctrine, the keynotes of his prayers are supplication and thanksgiving.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ahern, Barnabas M. *New Horizons* (Indiana: Fides Publishers, 1963).
- Amiot, François. *Les Idées Maitresses de Saint Paul* (Paris: Les Editions du Cerf, 1959).
- Audet, Jean Paul. *La Didache: instruction des apôtres* (Paris: J. Gabalda, 1958).
- Benoit, Pierre, transl. *Les Epîtres de Saint Paul* (Paris: Les Editions du Cerf, 1959).
- _____. *Exégèse et Théologie* (Paris: Les Editions du Cerf, 1961).
- Bonsirven, Joseph. *Theology of the New Testament*, transl. by S. F. L. Tye (Maryland: The Newman Press, 1963).
- Boudou, Adrien. *Saint Paul* (Paris, Beauchesne et ses Fils, 1950).
- Brown, Raymond E., et al., ed. *The Jerome Biblical Commentary*, vol. II (New Jersey, Prentice Hall, 1968).
- Cabaniss, Allen. "Early Christian Nighttime Worship," JBR 25 (1957) 30-35.

- Cerfaux, Lucien. *Christ in the Theology of St. Paul*, transl. by G. Webb and A. Walker (New York: Herder and Herder, 1958).
- Cullmann, Oscar. *Baptism in the New Testament*, transl. by J. K. S. Reid (London: SCM Press, 1961).
- _____. *Early Christian Worship*, transl. by S. T. Todd and J. B. Torrance (London: SCM Press, 1953).
- _____. "The Meaning of the Lord's Supper in Primitive Christianity," *Essays on the Lord's Supper* by O. Cullmann and F. J. Leenhardt, transl. by J. G. Davies (Virginia: John Knox Press, 1958).
- _____. "Paradosis and Kyrios," *Scott JT* 3 (1950) 180-197.
- Davies, William David. *Paul and Rabbinic Judaism*, 2nd ed. (London: S. P. C. K., 1955).
- Fitzmyer, Joseph A. *Pauline Theology* (New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1966).
- Hamman, Gautier Adalbert, ed. *Early Christian Prayers*, transl. by W. Mitchell (Chicago: Henry Regnery, 1961).
- Heiler, Friedrich. *Prayer, A Study in the History and Psychology of Religion*, transl. by S. McComb and J. E. Park (New York: Oxford University Press, 1932).
- Hunter, Archibald Macbride. *The Gospel according to St Paul* (London: SCM Press, 1966).
- _____. *Paul and His Predecessors*, 2nd ed. (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1961).
- Jeremias, Joachim. *The Central Message of the New Testament* (New York: Scribner, 1965).
- _____. *The Lord's Prayer*, transl. by J. Reumann (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1964).
- _____. *The Prayers of Jesus* (Illinois: Alec R. Allenson, 1967).
- Kilmartin, Edward J. *The Eucharist in the Primitive Church* (New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1965).
- Manson, Thomas Walter. *On Paul and John*, ed. by M. Black (Illinois: A. R. Allenson, 1963).
- Robinson, James M. "A Formal Analysis of Colossians 1:15-20," *JBL* 76 (1957) 270-87.
- Schmidt, Karl Ludwig. "Ἐκκλησια", *The Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*, ed. by Gerhard Kittel, transl. and ed. by G. W. Bromiley (Michigan: WM. B. Eerdmans, 1965) vol. II, pp. 506-513.
- Schmitt, Joseph. *Jesus Ressuscite dans la Prédication Apostolique* (Paris: Librairie Lecoffre, 1949).
- Schnackenburg, Rudolf. *New Testament Theology Today*, transl. by D.

Paul and Prayer (S. Masuda)

Askew (New York: Herder and Herder, 1963).

Simpson, Robert L. *The Interpretation of Prayer in the Early Church* (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1965).

Stanley, David M. *The Apostolic Church in the New Testament* (Maryland: The Newman Press, 1965).

_____. *A Modern Scriptural Approach to the Spiritual Exercises* (Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1967).

For scriptural citations, the Confraternity version and *The Interlinear Greek-English New Testament* (London: Samuel Bagster and Sons, 1967) were used.